

## Freedom of Information request disclosure log sheet

<b>Case No: 3</b>			
<b>Date Received: 02/05/2017</b>			
<b>Topic: Peer review of the report by Wilding TA and Black KD (SARF project)</b>			
<b>Request</b>			
<p>1) Please provide all information you hold concerning the peer review of the report by Wilding TA and Black KD. Particularly, please provide full information as to which named SARF directors raised concerns, and what the concerns raised by each named SARF director were</p> <p>2) If the SARF project was funded by the Crown Estate, directly or indirectly,</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>please provide full information on the process by which the project came about,</li> <li>how the decision was made</li> <li>by whom</li> <li>decision to the subject the PAMP2 report to peer review</li> <li>decision to commission Professor Edwards to write his report.</li> </ol> <p>3) Detail the degree to which you, any Scottish public authorities or any other party had any editorial control over either report</p>			
<b>Response</b>			
Exemption 39(2) from Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 applied			
1) Attached files:			
	Date	Document Title	EIR Exceptions
1	14/03/2016	01-SARF098-14-03-2016	
2	09/03/2016	02-SARF098-09-03-2016-	
3		03A-Terms of reference for an Independent report SARF098 24 03 2016	
4	24/03/2016	03-SARF098-24-03-2016-	
5	30/06/2016	04A-SARF098-Whole document 30 June 2016 (002)	
6		04B-SARF098 Emails Received from SAMS	
7	01/07/2016	04-SARF098-01-07-2106-	
8	01/07/2016	05-SARF098-02-07-2016-	
9	02/07/2016	06-SARF098-02-07-2016-	
10	04/07/2016	07-SARF098-04-07-2016-	11(2)
11	04/07/2016	08-SARF098-04-07-2016-	11(2)
12	04/07/2016	09-SARF098-04-07-2016-	
13	04/07/2016	010-SARF098-04-07-2016-	
14	05/07/2016	011-SARF098-05-07-2016-	11(2)
15	05/07/2016	012-SARF098-05-07-2016-	11(2)
16	11/07/2016	013-SARF098-11-07-2016-	11(2)
17	18/07/2016	014-SARF098-18-07-2016-	11(2)
18	22/07/2016	015-SARF-22-07-2106-	
19	22/07/2016	016-SARF-22-07-2016-	11(2)
20		Compiled first referee comments SARF098	
21		SARF 89 Final Report Evaluation Form SARF REF07	
22		SARF Final Report Evaluation Form – External – REF01	
23		SARF Final Report Evaluation Form – External_referee ID REF03	
24		SARF Final Report Evaluation Form – External-SARF098 REF02 30 Jan 2016	
25		SARF Final Report Evaluation Form 160205 – REF06	
26		SARF098 – PAMP Refreshment Study	
27		SARF098 Evaluation and External Memorandum – REF04	
28		SARF098 Reply to reviewers comments 18Dec 2015	

Includes emails between the directors; the initial call for proposals for the SARF098 study; a draft report of the study – reply to reviewer’s comments; evaluation form for most of the reviewers – we do not hold reviewer 05 in our records; and a first review draft report. Exception 11(2) in Environmental Information (Scotland) Regulations 2004 is applied, where the redactions are personal email addresses of the 3 directors; releasing this information would contravene the first Principle of the Data Protection Act 1998.

- 2) The Crown Estate provided core funding to SARF as well as periodic additional funding for special projects (of which this PAMP2 study was not one) which ceased after the 2015-16 Financial Year. Alex Adrian was not appointed a director of SARF until 2015, after the PAMP2 study was commissioned and Crown Estate Scotland holds no information on its commissioning nor decisions on its peer review other than what is contained in the appended documents
- 3) Matters relating editorial control are contained in the information supplied, and we have no additional information or knowledge of any such exercised by any other Scottish public authority or third party

If you require any of the listed documents enclosed in a request for information, please contact:

**Email**

[enquiries@crownestatescotland.com](mailto:enquiries@crownestatescotland.com)

**Post**

6 Bells Brae  
Edinburgh  
EH4 3BJ

**Phone**

0131 260 6070

Please quote the Case Number, item number(s) and document name(s).